



ترجمة ملخصات المحتوى

**Summaries of Researches and Articles**

## **The Role of French Orientalist León Gauthier (1862- 1949) in the Cultural Dialogue Between East and West**

**Anwar Mahmoud Zinati (\*)** |

This essay examines the work and intellectual output of the French Orientalist León Gauthier. It is the first study in Arabic which explores the thought of Gauthier, a prominent orientalist who has received wide acclaim but has not gained ample recognition in studies which provide an impartial presentation of his thought and introduce him to the Arab reader. The essay discusses in detail the perspective of Gauthier and his role in the cultural dialogue between East and West. It is important to mention that despite the variety in its aims (which include religious and missionary objectives), colonial orientalism was not entirely lacking in scholarly benefits, even if these were not intended in particular. This essay presents a descriptive-critical review of Gauthier's most important ideas on the cultural dialogue between East and West, for the purpose of reaching logical conclusions on a critical era of the history of relations between the two. The essay employs a historical approach, and makes an occasional use of analytical-critical and descriptive approaches.

**Keywords:** French Orientalism, León Gauthier, Cultural Dialogue, Cultural Communication Between East and West.

---

(\*)- Ain Shams University, Egypt

## Nöldeke's Selective Approach to the Holy Quran and Its Effect in Generating Fallacies Which Allege the Distortion of the Holy Text

| Sajid Sabah al-Askari (\*) |

Many of the fallacies promoted by orientalists are founded on projections on certain hadiths. These projections are rooted in intellectual, political or other such backgrounds, for the purpose of consolidating a misconception among Western and Eastern audiences by casting doubt on the source of the Quran and attempting to present it as a distorted text. This process has generated a set of fallacies regarding the authenticity of the Quran based on a selective method which orientalists have adopted in their studies. This method entails that the orientalist selects a certain perspective among proposed theories and viewpoints in a specific discipline, or relies on certain opinions or narrations to establish a specific vision, with the aim of judging the other in the light of that vision. Selectiveness in this sense means the projection of ideas by choosing what suits the personal cultural background of the individual carrying out the projection.

This essay discusses the selective methodology adopted by the German orientalist Theodor Nöldeke in his study of the Quran, a methodology which generates fallacies which entail the false claim of the distortion of the Quran. This essay first deals with the allegation of the distortion of the Holy Quran, concerning the omission of verses, the abrogation of the recitation of certain verses, and the variant readings. The second section discusses topics which might contribute to the allegation of the occurrence of distortion in the Quran, such as the compilation of the Quran by relying on a single witness or two witnesses, and the seven ah̄ruf theory.

**Keywords:** Nöldeke, Selective Methodology, Abrogation of Recitation of Certain Quranic Verses, Variant Readings of the Quran, Compilation of the Quran.

---

(\*)- Researcher at Imam Jaafar Al-Sadiq University, Thi Qar Branch, Iraq.

## The Quran and Pre-Islamic Poetry According to Tisdall

| Mahmoud Kishaneh(\*) |

This essay examines the nature of the position of British orientalist William St. Clair Tisdall on the Holy Quran and pre-Islamic poetry. It attempts to prove that Tisdall believed that the Quran borrowed content from pre-Islamic poetry, and that Tisdall even reached the extent of alleging a human origin to the Quran.

This essay attempts to clarify Tisdall's stance toward the Quran and the pre-Islamic poetry of Imru' al-Qays and Ummayy ibn Abi al-Salt. It strives to reveal Tisdall's position: Did he adopt the allegation of borrowing or did he oppose it? And if he opposed it or did not fully accept it, then why did he mention it in his book? The essay also aims to present a scholarly response which demonstrates the error of the premises which this allegation proceeds from. The response is based on two matters: an outer critique of the poetical texts cited by Tisdall, and an inner critique which exposes many points which refute Tisdall's opinion. Thus, this essay aims to reveal the flawed foundation of this allegation, which leads to its collapse. It is also relevant to recognize Tisdall's bias against anything Islamic, as this will serve to clarify that his work represents an attempt to cast doubt on the divine origin of the Holy Quran. The essay employs an analytical-critical approach which first analyzes Tisdall's position on the issue, and then critiques it at a scholarly and religious level.

**Keywords:** Quran, Pre-Islamic Poetry, Tisdall.

---

(\*)- Egyptian Researcher and Author. Lecturer at the University of Cairo, Khartoum Branch

lived in an environment which was not aware of these fields of knowledge.

As for the orientalist allegations which claim that Prophet Muhammad collected the stories from Jewish or Christian sources, such claims collapse when faced with historical criticism. An examination of the figures whom orientalists claim to have influenced the Quran proves the failure of this claim. So does the comparative study of Biblical and Quranic stories which reveals a fundamental contrast between both; Biblical stories attribute immoral actions to prophets, and ascribes drunkenness, nudity, fornication, deception, and idol-making to them, while the Quran, on the other hand, elevates prophets to a high moral status and praises their ethical qualities.

As for the orientalist attempt to deny the miraculous nature of the Quran by accusing it of being an incoherent text due to an alleged lack of thematic unity among the verses, the presence of repetition, and the multiplicity of readings, this involves a misapplication. Orientalists have treated the Quran as a philosophical, literary or historical book whereas the Quran possesses its own unique style. It is not subject to the usual rules of composition and expression, rather its style is based on the ultimate purpose for which it was revealed -the guidance of human beings. The lack of thematic unity and the presence of repetition superbly serve this goal, as the former is in harmony with human nature in its variety of dimensions, circumstances and needs, while the latter is an educational method which contributes to character building.

Keywords: Inimitability, Quran, Prophet Muhammad (ﷺ), Orientalists.

## **Inimitability of the Quran: A Foundational-Critical Review of Orientalist Fallacies**

| **Samer Tawfiq Ajami<sup>(\*)</sup>** |

Upon examining the work of orientalists, one might discern a hostile oriental stance toward the Holy Quran, represented by claims such as the denial of the inimitability of the Holy Quran. In fact, orientalists have presented a number of fallacies in an attempt to prove their point. The critique and discussion of these orientalist fallacies is founded on identifying the indicators of inimitability and applying them to the Holy Quran. They are as follows: proclamation of prophecy, presenting a challenge, emergence of the inimitable object/occurrence, and the failure of the challenged party to produce a similar output. Thus, the argument may be phrased as follows: Muhammad (ﷺ) declared his divine prophecy and challenged people with the Quran, proclaiming their failure to produce anything like it. Historical evidence bears witness to this fact, for the Arabs who enjoyed a high literary tradition were unable to rise to the challenge, and acknowledged that the Quran could not have been produced by a human. The language of the Quran proved to be essentially different from any work of literature from the seventh century.

Furthermore, the Quran is a miracle not only in its linguistic aspect, but also in its doctrinal, ethical and legislative dimensions. It is full of miraculous aspects such as its capacity to accomplish spiritual transformation, its narration of the accounts of prophets, its mention of scientific facts which have only been revealed in modern times, its inner harmony, its unprecedented rhetoric, and its aesthetical representation. This is especially emphasized when we recall that Prophet Muhammad (ﷺ)

---

(\*)- Researcher of Quranic Studies, Lebanon.

# The Encyclopedia Entry on Islam in the General Encyclopaedia: Review and Criticism

| Ahmed Al-Bahnasi (\*) |

Despite the prevalence of political concerns in the intellectual output of Israeli orientalism, religious themes have also made an appearance. This is evident in the article **אסלאם** (“Islam”) in the General Encyclopaedia, published in the Hebrew language and edited by the Jewish historian and writer Josphe Klausner. The entry extends for 38 pages within the encyclopedia and includes a number of false assumptions about Islam and its origins. It most notably attributes Islam to Jewish and Christian sources, and describes Islamic conquests as “occupations.”

This essay presents objective historical and scholarly evidence on the impossibility of Islam being influenced by Judaism and Christianity, as well as evidence from the writings of impartial orientalists who have maintained that Islamic conquests were not occupations but rather expansions aimed at spreading religion and eliminating oppression. The essay also critiques the most prominent methodologies employed by the author of the encyclopedia entry. It demonstrates that the “effect on/influenced by” approach is not objective, but is rather founded on depriving an intellectual phenomenon from its content, and attributing it to outer elements. The essay also detects how the author employs the “projective” approach to describe Islamic conquests as “occupations” in various parts of the entry, without providing any scholarly evidence or historical proof for his claim. This confirms that the author’s use of this methodology is purely subjective. The author also uses the “descriptive” approach, as the nature of the article is encyclopedic and is expected to provide as much information as possible. Nonetheless, the author does not adhere to this approach throughout his article but uses other methodologies which serve his ideology.

**Keywords:** Islam, Quran, Muhammad, Encyclopedia, Judaism, Christianity.

---

(\*) Egyptian Researcher on Israeli Orientalism.

**La Vie de Mahomed (The Life of Muhammad) by  
Henri de Boulainvilliers:  
Knowledge of History and Astronomical Sciences Reveal the Genuineness of  
Prophet Muhammad's (ﷺ) Message**

| Dr Makki Saadallah' (\*) |

This essay analyzes the work of the French Orientalist, Count Henri de Boulainvilliers, through his book *The Life of Muhammad* which includes “contemplations on the Muhammadi religion and the traditions of Muslims.” This book is distinguished by being a biography which discusses the life of Prophet Muhammad (ﷺ) with a certain degree of objectivity compared to works on Prophet Muhammad (ﷺ) which are a product of the West in general or orientalism in particular. This may be traced to De Boulainvilliers’ intellectual project which he founded on revision, investigation and criticism, an objective and moderate scholarly approach, the rejection of surface reading, and the refusal of ideological impulsiveness or sectarian biases in the recording of history.

De Boulainvilliers did not resort to comparing between writings or reviews for rectification, or embarking on doctrinal dialectics by defending a certain affiliation, but relied on a scholarly method, a knowledge of history, and astronomical sciences – and this constituted a new turning point in the study of the biography of Prophet Muhammad (ﷺ). This essay aims to examine the methodology and scholarly perspectives which De Boulainvilliers applied to Prophet Muhammad’s (ﷺ) biography, which were contrary to the opinions of the thinkers of the Age of Enlightenment and De Boulainvilliers’ contemporary orientalists. Thus, De Boulainvilliers reached fair conclusions regarding a central figure which has long occupied human thought.

**Keywords:** Muhammad, Henri de Boulainvilliers.

---

(\*) - Researcher and Professor. Tebessi University, Algeria.